
NYISO Business Issues Committee Meeting Minutes
February 14, 2018
10:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.

1. Introductions, Meeting Objectives, and Chairman’s Report

Mr. Andrew Antinori (NYPA) called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. by welcoming the members of the BIC. The members of the BIC identified themselves and attendance was recorded. A quorum was determined.

2. Approval of BIC Minutes

There were no comments or questions regarding the draft meeting minutes for the January 17, 2018 BIC meeting that were included with the meeting material.

Motion #1:

Motion to approve the January 17, 2018 BIC meeting minutes.

Motion passed unanimously.

3. Market Operations Report and Broader Regional Markets Report

Mr. Rana Mukerji (NYISO) reviewed the Market Operations report posted with the meeting material. Mr. Howard Fromer (PSEG) asked whether the uplift values for January 2018 reflect consultation efforts that may be underway. Mr. Mukerji indicated that the NYISO would need to follow-up on this request.

Mr. Mukerji reviewed the Broader Regional Markets report included with the meeting material. There were no questions or comments.

4. Day-Ahead Market Congestion Settlements

Mr. Tolu Dina (NYISO) reviewed the presentation posted with the meeting material.

Mr. David Clarke (LIPA) noted support for the proposed change and indicated that the reviews to date have not indicated any concerns with the current *de minimis* threshold value

Motion #2:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby recommends that the Management Committee (“MC”) approve revisions to Attachment N of the NYISO’s Open Access Transmission Tariff (OATT), as more fully described in the “Revision to OATT Attachment N – DAM Congestion Settlements Informational Calculations” presentation made to the BIC on February 14, 2018.

Motion passed unanimously with abstentions.

5. External Capacity Rights for the 2018/2019 Capability Year

Mr. Josh Boles (NYISO) reviewed the presentation posted with the meeting material.

Mr. Scott Leuthauser (HQUS) asked for clarification regarding why the value for Ontario increased significantly since last year while other areas remained relatively unchanged. Mr. Boles stated that the limits change every year as part of the MARS analysis and such changes are driven by many factors including updates to external Control Area models and assumptions made by the NYSRC. Mr. Boles also stated the NYISO would continue to review questions that have been raised by HQUS and provide information to stakeholders and the NYSRC as it became known.

Mr. Jim D’Andrea (Ravenswood), Mr. Matt Picardi (Shell), Ms. Kelli Joseph (NRG) and Ms. Doreen Saia (Greenburg Traurig) requested that any follow-up regarding what is driving outcomes and any potential changes be considered for

future analysis be discussed with all stakeholders. Mr. Boles clarified that any follow-up would be discussed with all stakeholders and the NYSRC.

Mr. D'Andrea raised concerns about the need for the Operating Committee to review the proposed values. Mr. Boles stated that these limit values establish a starting point for determining allowable capacity imports subject to reliability requirements and without violating the 0.1 LOLE criterion.

Motion #3:

The Business Issues Committee (BIC) hereby approves revisions to the Installed Capacity Manual as presented at the February 14, 2018 BIC Meeting.

Motion passed by majority with abstentions.

6. Alternative Methods for Determining LCRs: Final Market Design

Mr. Zachary Stines (NYISO) reviewed the presentation posted with the meeting material.

Ms. Saia asked for clarification regarding the base case to be used for the Locational Minimum Installed Capacity Requirement (LCR) optimization. Mr. Stines clarified that base case would be updated for changes in the load forecast following completion of NYCA Installed Reserve Margin (IRM) analysis, as well as the potential for updates to the status of resources. Ms. Saia recommended that the NYISO clarify factors that could be updated as part of presentation to the Management Committee (MC) on this proposal.

Mr. Dave Clarke (LIPA) noted for the record that: "the method proposed has not resulted in decreased volatility for LI, in fact has increased the LI LCR year to year volatility as well as the cost to LI customers, including volatility arising from the degree to which a unit added in a location in Zone G reduces upstream net interface limits." He noted LIPA's continued opposition to the approach, and reiterated his request that prior to the vote, NYISO redo their consumer analysis with the 2018 updates that result in much larger impacts on LI. Mr. Fromer supported Mr. Clarke's request for updated information based on the 2018 analysis and requested that the NYISO consider providing additional information prior to a vote at the MC.

Ms. Joseph raised concerns about the lack of analysis on combined effects of various potential changes on LCR volatility under the new methodology. Ms. Joseph stated that in the absence of such analysis it is unclear whether the revised methodology will be appropriate on a going forward basis.

Ms. Jane Quinn (Con Edison) provided the following statements for the minutes:

Con Edison and Orange & Rockland appreciate the NYISO's efforts on this complex issue. We can support this proposal today because of the inclusion of a Transmission Security Level that considers the reliability needs of the system while producing more stable and predictable LCRs. It should address the reliability concerns Con Edison expressed about this project. We thank NYISO staff for working with us and other stakeholders on this creative solution.

Motion #4:

The Business Issues Committee ("BIC") hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve revisions to the NYISO's Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff to revise the existing rules and establish the alternative method for Locational Minimum Installed Capacity Requirements, as described in the presentation and as discussed during the February 14, 2018 BIC meeting.

Motion passed with 73.97% affirmative votes.

7. On Ramps and Off Ramps: Complete Market Design

Mr. Zach T. Smith (NYISO) reviewed the presentation posted with the meeting material.

Mr. Leuthauser (HQUS) asked for clarification regarding the rationale for using a load flow methodology instead of a probabilistic analysis. Mr. Zach T. Smith stated that, in part, the decision was made to provide transparency as to the analysis in that the probabilistic analysis provides for less capability to share all modeling assumptions with stakeholders. Mr. Zach T. Smith further noted that transmission security analysis is used to identify areas of the system that are transmission constrained and therefore may require a locational price signal.

Mr. Fromer asked whether the results of the NYISO's analysis varies dependent on the availability/performance of resources. Mr. Zach G. Smith noted that the proposed Locality creation and elimination assessments generally do not account for resource availability/performance. Mr. Zach T. Smith added that the proposed Locality creation and elimination tests are intended to identify where locational price signals should exist, while the actual capacity requirements procured through the market are set using a probabilistic analysis that accounts for resource availability/performance.

Mr. Pallas LeeVanSchaick (MMU) raised a concern that transmission security analysis does not provide the capability to create a Locality to reflect essentially an over-supply condition within a particular transmission constrained area.

Mr. Clarke noted concerns that potential for elimination of G-J Locality in combination with the proposed alternative LCR calculation methodology could result in unwarranted cost shifts to LI consumers. Mr. Clarke requested that the NYISO conduct analysis to evaluate the potential impacts on LI LCRs that could result under new LCR optimization method from potential elimination of the G-J Locality.

Mr. Fromer asked for clarification of whether the rules provide any signal for identifying generation pockets. Mr. Zach G. Smith (NYISO) noted that the deliverability study process would provide an ability for identifying this type of issue. Mr. LeeVanSchaick stated that while the deliverability construct could address this issue, he contends that it is not the most efficient method for addressing it.

Mr. Fromer requested clarification regarding procedures for applying generation contingencies as part of the proposed assessments. Mr. Zach T. Smith explained that generator contingencies are taken before applying the N-1-1 analysis. Mr. Zach G. Smith added that the design of the test is to apply the reliability criteria to the system in the absence of the generation associated with the generator contingencies and determine whether in the absence of such generation transmission security is maintained.

Mr. Clarke asked whether the NYISO has conducted analysis to determine where the system would likely be on the various ICAP Demand Curves when Localities are eliminated or created. Mr. Zach T. Smith noted that for the scenarios assessed involving elimination of G-J Locality indicated that the system would be quite far down the NYCA ICAP Demand Curve at the time that Locality elimination would occur, but that the NYISO did not have the exact data on hand.

Mr. Matt Litchfield (CPV) noted objection to excluding New York City (NYC) and LI from the proposed Locality creation and elimination tests. Mr. Kevin Lang (Couch White) noted agreement that under current conditions it does not appear appropriate to study NYC for elimination, but he believes that it is unnecessary to declare NYC a permanent Locality. Mr. Fromer stated his support for the proposal to exclude NYC and LI from the proposed Locality creation and elimination tests.

Mr. Fromer asked for clarification of when, if adopted, the proposed rules would first be utilized. Mr. Zach T. Smith stated that rules would first apply using the 2020 RNA and any Locality changes arising out of that analysis would be effectuated for the 2022/2023 Capability Year with revised ICAP Demand Curves reflecting any changes posted to the NYISO's website by November 30, 2021.

Mr. Fromer requested clarification regarding base case inclusion rules for transmission facilities resulting from Public Policy Transmission Planning Process (PPTPP). Mr. Zach G. Smith stated that projects selected through the PPTPP would generally be included in the Locality creation and elimination tests beginning with their expected in-service dates provided that the project is continuing to proceed as anticipated.

Mr. Fromer asked whether NYISO would take account of status of Article VII process for projects selected through the Comprehensive System Planning Process (CSPP). Mr. Zach G. Smith replied that the RNA base case inclusion rules provide flexibility to consider ongoing regulatory proceedings, such as Article VII, and their potential impacts on whether a given project should be included in the base case.

Mr. Lang asked for clarification regarding the timing to eliminate a Locality. Mr. Zach T. Smith stated that elimination would occur intra-reset period approximately 12 months after the filing with FERC identifying elimination of a Locality.

Mr. Fromer asked for clarification regarding how the NYISO would treat generators that have forward sales to an external system for purposes of transmission security analysis. Mr. Zach G. Smith stated for transmission security analysis there are no adjustments, but noted that there is different treatment of forward capacity sales for resource adequacy analysis where known forward sales to external areas would be accounted for.

Mr. Mark Younger (Hudson Energy Economics) provided the following statement for the minutes:

The NYISO's proposal for the On and Off Ramp Test is a flawed market design. It is attempting to use a Transmission Security test to estimate a Resource Adequacy requirement. The result of the NYISO's test as proposed is that it will understate the Resource Adequacy need and would therefore result in creating Localities too late, eliminating them too early. This would result in not sending efficient price signals and increasing the potential to need RMR contracts because a Locality was not created when it was needed.

The NYISO assures the reliability of its system by performing both Transmission Security and Resource Adequacy evaluations and assuring that both requirements are met. Transmission security is the ability of the power system to withstand disturbances, such as short circuits or unanticipated loss of system elements, and continue to supply and deliver electricity. The purpose of the capacity market is to assure that the NYISO can meet its Resource Adequacy requirements, provide a means for resources to recover a portion of fixed costs, and provide a market signal for investment. Resource adequacy is the ability of the electric systems to supply the aggregate electricity demand and energy requirements of the customers at all times, taking into account scheduled and unscheduled outages of system elements. Resource adequacy considers the transmission systems, generation resources, and other capacity resources, such as demand response. Resource adequacy assessments are performed on a probabilistic basis to capture the random natures of system element outages. Capacity Localities are used to assure that the market will provide the right price signals to develop and maintain resources in the right locations to be able to provide resource adequacy. Whether the NYISO needs to create a new capacity Locality or whether it can eliminate a capacity Locality is an issue of Resource Adequacy. The NYISO has proposed to evaluate whether it needs to create a new Locality or to eliminate a Locality based upon a Transmission Security based test.

Transmission Security and Resource Adequacy are not the same reliability issue. The NYISO has provided no analysis that their Transmission Security based test, as proposed for the On and Off Ramp process, adequately estimates the capacity needed to assure Resource Adequacy. If they have performed any analysis, they have not presented it to Market Participants. When stakeholders presented their own analysis showing that the Transmission Security based On and Off Ramp test significantly understates the locational need for capacity, the NYISO dismissed those analyses without providing any basis for the dismissal other than asserting that they believe their proposed

transmission security based analysis is sufficient. Again, Transmission Security and Resource Adequacy are not the same reliability need. The NYISO cannot use the test for one type of reliability need, Transmission Security, to estimate the amount of capacity that is needed for an entirely different type of reliability need, Resource Adequacy, without first showing that the test based on the one type of need is a good proxy for the other need.

While the NYISO has dismissed the data that has been provided by stakeholders, improving the NYISO's proposal would be relatively easy. The tool that the NYISO has developed to perform the Alternative LCR Methodology could easily be applied to the On Ramp Off Ramp model to determine the Resource Adequacy based Locational Requirements. Specifically, if the model were run allowing the IRM to be optimized along with the LCRs, it could identify the Resource Adequacy based minimums that are needed in different segments. For example, the NYISO could estimate the minimum capacity requirement for New York City by modeling NYC with a Net CONE that is significantly above the Net CONE for the other zones in the NYISO. The analysis could be performed using a Net CONE for the Locality that is 2, 5, or even ten times as high as the remainder of the NYCA. The model would attempt to shift as much capacity as it could out of the higher priced area and provide the minimum that is required to assure that the marginal LOLE benefit of additional capacity in the region is 2, 5, or 10 times as capacity added elsewhere.

Mr. Matt Schwall (IPPNY) provided the following statement for the minutes:

As IPPNY has previously stated in written comments and IPPNY members have further established during the NYISO stakeholder meetings addressing this issue, IPPNY has serious concerns with core aspects of the NYISO's proposed On Ramp/Off Ramp concept for creating and eliminating capacity zones, concerns which are shared by a significant number of stakeholders, including the NYISO's independent Market Monitoring Unit. These concerns stem from a serious flaw in the NYISO's proposed market design which will cause resource adequacy needs for a locality to be severely understated. Specifically, the NYISO has erroneously sought to use a transmission security based test to determine a resource adequacy requirement. The consequences of moving forward with this flawed approach will be two-fold: (1) capacity zones will be prematurely eliminated when locality specific price signals are still needed to maintain resource adequacy; and (2) capacity zones will be created too late, resulting in the potential need for reliability-must-run contracts. The 2-G and 4-G components of the NYISO's proposal are nothing more than ill-fitted band-aids that do not actually correct for the underlying flaws in the overall design itself. There can be no mistaking that this proposal will cause increased market uncertainty and investment curtailment. Therefore, a majority of IPPNY's members will be voting in opposition to the NYISO's proposed On Ramp/Off Ramp market design concept at today's Business Issues Committee meeting.

Mr. Marc Montalvo (UIU) provided the following statement for the minutes:

The UIU's decision to abstain on the on-ramp/off-ramp proposal reflects a couple of issues that we attempting to balance. On the one hand we continue to have concerns that (1) substantively, the proposed thresholds for creating or eliminating zones lack a clear economic or reliability rationale linked to the broader objectives of the capacity market and (2) there remain unanswered questions about the expected performance of the design. On the other hand, UIU remains concerned that without a commitment to a process to explore alternatives, there may be no process to address issues with existing zones, which is not in the interest of consumers.

Ms. Patti Caletka (NYSEG/RG&E) provided the following statement for the minutes:

NYSEG welcomes the changes related to Capacity Zone creation and elimination, i.e., On Ramp/Off Ramp Market Design. We continue, however, to be concerned that the “off ramp” design represents a very high hurdle that will mean that zones are rarely, if ever, eliminated. We encourage the NYISO and Market Participants to continue efforts to improve this proposal.

Mr. Clarke provided the following statement for the minutes:

For the record, our concern is that with the elimination of the G-J zone coupled with NYISO’s Alternative LCR initiative that we discussed this morning, LI would become the swing supplier of NYC reliability services associated with Installed Capacity. Since Zone G-I capacity has a larger impact on NYC reliability than Western New York capacity does, we are concerned with the incentive to locate upstate (where net costs are lower) rather than Zone G-J that could arise if Zone G is eliminated. We had asked NYISO to evaluate the differences in reliability impact for upstate versus G-I capacity, and NYISO has declined to do so, and we oppose this proposal. We would like NYISO to evaluate the impact of reliability based on where the capacity is added, and provide an incentive to locate capacity where it supports NYC reliability needs which otherwise LI would be required to supply as swing supplier.

Mr. Fromer stated that while PSEG opposes this proposal, it supports continued efforts related to the development of a reasonable rule set for Locality creation and elimination that has broad stakeholder support.

Mr. LeeVanSchaick stated the MMU has significant concerns with the NYISO's proposal. Mr. LeeVanSchaick acknowledged that the current process is not optimal, but the NYISO’s proposal presents concerns because, like the current process, it does not identify needs for locational price signals based on resource adequacy needs. Mr. LeeVanSchaick further noted concerns that the proposal could result in not identifying a need for a new Locality sufficiently in advance of a resource adequacy need arising and potentially eliminating Localities too soon.

Mr. Antinori asked whether the NYISO would be willing to engage in further discussions on development of rules for creation and elimination. Mr. Mukerji stated that any further development of Locality creation and elimination rules would need to be prioritized as part of the 2019 project prioritization. Mr. Mukerji noted that NYISO does not currently have available resources to address this matter in 2018. Mr. Rich Dewey (NYISO) added that in order for the NYISO to further address Locality creation and elimination in 2018 further discussions through BPWG about re-prioritization of 2018 projects would be necessary to provide resources to support continued such efforts. Mr. Mukerji noted that designing a methodology based on resource adequacy would require a fundamental re-design of the current proposal for which resources in 2018 were not allocated.

Mr. John Borchert (Central Hudson) stated that Central Hudson is interested in moving these efforts forward to provide a reasonable rule set for Locality elimination. Mr. Borchert noted that the NYISO has built in adequate safeguards to prevent premature elimination of Localities. Mr. Borchert further stated that Central Hudson supports elimination of Localities when they are no longer needed from a reliability perspective and a rule set needs to be in place to facilitate such elimination.

Mr. Lang (Couch White) noted Multiple Intervenors support for Central Hudson's position regarding the need to implement rules to facilitate Locality elimination when a Locality is no longer needed.

Motion #5:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve revisions to the NYISO’s Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff and Open Access Transmission Tariff as provided in the

materials for the February 14, 2018 BIC meeting to establish a method for eliminating Localities and revise the existing rules to create a new Locality, as described in the on ramps/off ramps presentation and as discussed during the February 14, 2018 BIC meeting.

Motion failed with 54.26% affirmative votes.

Working Group Updates

- Billing and Accounting and Credit Working Group – The group has not met since the last BIC meeting.
- Electric System Planning Working Group – The group has met twice since the last BIC meeting. The group met on January 24, 2018 and reviewed results from the 2017 CARIS Phase 1 study. The group also met on February 7, 2018 and reviewed the draft 2017 CARIS Phase 1 study report.
- Installed Capacity Working Group – The group has met three times since the last BIC meeting. The group met jointly with MIWG on January 25, 2018 and reviewed a proposal regarding CRIS for external transmission upgrades that provide incremental transfer capability into the Rest of State capacity region, the alternative methodology for determining LCRs and an update regarding the Integrating Public Policy initiative. On February 2, 2018, the group met and reviewed the On Ramps and Off Ramps proposal, and a presentation by GE Energy Consulting regarding the scope of a study it will be conducting to provide information regarding the capacity value of resources with energy limitations. The group also met jointly with MIWG on February 6, 2018 and reviewed the alternative methodology for determining LCRs, ICAP Manual revisions related to External ICAP rights for the 2018/2019 Capability Year, and potential market design enhancements related to accommodating public policy as part of the Integrating Public Policy initiative.
- Electric Gas Coordination Working Group – The group has not met since the last BIC meeting.
- Load Forecasting Task Force – The group has not met since the last BIC meeting.
- Market Issues Working Group – The group has met twice since the last BIC meeting. On January 25, 2018, the group met jointly with ICAPWG and reviewed an update regarding the Integrating Public Policy initiative. The group also met jointly with ICAPWG on February 6, 2018 and reviewed proposed revenue allocation procedures for Non-Historic Fixed Price TCCs, potential market design enhancements related to accommodating public policy as part of the Integrating Public Policy initiative, and an update regarding the Securing 100+ kV Transmission Facilities in the Market Model project.
- Price Responsive Load Working Group – The group met jointly with ICAPWG on February 2, 2018 to review the agenda item related to the GE Energy Consulting study.

8. New Business

There was no new business.

Meeting adjourned at 2:00 p.m.

Business Issues Committee
February 14, 2018
Final Motions

Motion #1:

Motion to approve the January 17, 2018 meeting minutes.

Motion passed unanimously with an abstention.

Motion #2:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby recommends that the Management Committee (“MC”) approve revisions to Attachment N of the NYISO’s Open Access Transmission Tariff (OATT), as more fully described in the “Revision to OATT Att N – DAM Congestion Settlements Informational Calculations” presentation made to the BIC on February 14, 2018.

Motion passed unanimously with abstentions.

Motion #3:

The Business Issues Committee (BIC) hereby approves revisions to the Installed Capacity Manual as presented at the February 14, 2018 BIC Meeting.

Motion passed by majority with abstentions.

Motion #4:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve revisions to the NYISO’s Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff to revise the existing rules and establish the alternative method for Locational Minimum Installed Capacity Requirements, as described in the presentation and as discussed during the February 14, 2018 BIC meeting.

Motion passed with 73.97% affirmative votes.

Motion #5:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve revisions to the NYISO’s Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff and Open Access Transmission Tariff as provided in the materials for the February 14, 2018 BIC meeting to establish a method for eliminating Localities and revise the existing rules to create a new Locality, as described in the on ramps/off ramps presentation and as discussed during the February 14, 2018 BIC meeting.

Motion failed with 54.26% affirmative votes.

New York Independent System Operator - Committee Membership

Business Issues Committee - February 14, 2018 - NYISO KCC - Parties Checked in Attendance

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Astoria Energy LLC	Generation Owners	McCall, Chuck	Browne , Scott	Habib , Phillipe	Singer, Leonard					✓ Schwall, Matt	
Bayonne Energy Center, LLC	Generation Owners	Allman , Ellen	Yang , Sue	Caplan , Stu						✓ Schwall, Matt	
CPV Valley LLC	Generation Owners	✓Litchfield , Matt	Rumsey , Tom								
Calpine	Generation Owners	Kruse, Brett	Reitmeyer , Jay	Flumerfelt, John	Schleimer , Steve					✓ Schwall, Matt	
Cricket Valley Energy Center	Generation Owners	Davis , Charles	✓Wallenstein , Arnold	✓Paryl , Ron							
EDP Renewables North America LLC	Generation Owners	Brodbeck , John	Kaplan , Seth	Nemeth , Jeffrey	High , Jeremy	Priemer , Dustin					
East Coast Power, LLC	Generation Owners	Shanker, Roy	Fogarty , Thomas	Lee , Tina	Franzetti , Paul					✓ Schwall, Matt	
Empire Generating Co, LLC	Generation Owners	Nuss , Kurt	Argetsinger , Andrew	Willson , Darrell	Swenson , Nils					✓ Schwall, Matt	
Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Generation Owners	Dell Orto , Ken	✓Saia, Doreen	Bergeron , John							
Helix Ravenswood LLC	Generation Owners	✓D'Andrea , James	Kline , Marc	DiBari , Dominic							
Howard Wind LLC	Generation Owners	Merich , Olivia	Rugh , Chris								
Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Generation Owners	Ferguson, Mike	Younger, Mark							✓ Schwall, Matt	
Innovative Energy Systems	Generation Owners	Zeliff, Peter	Henningham, Scott								
Invenergy Energy Management LLC	Generation Owners	Pakula , Maggie	Goldstein , Michael	Orzel , Chris						✓ Schwall, Matt	
National Grid Generation LLC	Generation Owners	Kain , Terrence	McCabe , Brian								
Noble Environmental Power LLC	Generation Owners	Silton , Harry									
Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP	Generation Owners	Biittig, Timothy	Ryan , James							Schwall, Matt	
Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Generation Owners	Gregson , Brian	Goodenough , Jeery	Evanoski , Dave						✓ Schwall, Matt	
BJ Energy LLC	Other Suppliers	Ni, Bing	Lee, George								
BP Energy Company	Other Suppliers	Chintapalli , Raj	Magruder , Kathy							✓ Ackerman, Alan	
BioUrja Power, LLC	Other Suppliers	Moore , Cody	Ward , Roxie								
BlueRock Energy, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Nichols , Jim	Yeager , Keith	VanHorne , Phil	Graham , Tammy						
Brookfield Energy Marketing L.P.	Other Suppliers	✓LaRoe , Chris	Mitreski , Aleksandar	Mitelman , Rimma	Dallaire , Eric						
CPower	Other Suppliers	✓Dotson-Westphalen , Peter	Houirhan , Michael	Damaskos , Deno	Campbell , Bruce						
Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.	Other Suppliers	Stuss , Gordon	Romine , Brad	Emmett , Robert							
Citigroup Energy Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Trayers, Barry									
Con Edison Solutions Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Mah, Norman	Dannels , Jeff								
Constellation New Energy	Other Suppliers	Barlette , Richard	Kirk , Steven								
Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC	Other Suppliers	Reinhart, Brian	✓Rotger, Jose								
DC Energy	Other Suppliers	✓Bleiweis, Bruce	Stevens, Andrew	Tate, Matthew	Milberg, Sadao	Jeev , Kumar					
DTE Energy	Other Suppliers	Pakela, Gregory	Wieszczyk, Raymond	✓German , Robert							
Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC	Other Suppliers	✓Galarneau , Kenneth	Philips , Marjorie	Comstock , Read							
Drift Marketplace, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Tilley , Alan	Robinson , Greg								
Dynegy Marketing and Trade	Other Suppliers	✓Roby , Rick	Ellis, Dean	Ziegler , Pete							
EDF Trading North America, LLC	Other Suppliers	Erbrick , Michael	LeForce , Randall								
Eastern Generation	Other Suppliers	✓Baker, Liam	Reese, John	Younger, Mark	✓Schwall , Matthew	Johnson , David	Wolcott , Tyler				
EnerNoc	Other Suppliers	Brewster, David	Geller , Greg								
Energy Spectrum	Other Suppliers	David, Gary	Ahrens, David	Neiburg, David	Iskowitz, Aron	Brown, Ruben	Pentland , William	Villegas , Cristina	Cinadr , Matt		
Energy Technology Savings	Other Suppliers	Hendler , Jeff	Ross , Valerie								
Exelon Generating Co. LLC	Other Suppliers	Barlette , Richard	Kirk , Steven							✓ Schwall, Matt	
GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Levine , Jeffrey	Hawkins , Darin	Campbell , Chad							
Galt Power	Other Suppliers	Fernands , Rochelle	✓Ackerman, Alan								
HQ Energy Services US	Other Suppliers	Plante , Matthieu	✓Leuthauser, Scott	Guilbault , Louis	Bélanger , Frédéric						
Innoventive Power	Other Suppliers	Gruber , Craig	Halford , Steve								
Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC	Other Suppliers	Ralston , William	Hebel , Nathan	Carrigan , Kathleen							
Mercuria Energy America, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Davis , Andrew	Younger, Mark	Frye , Samuel						✓ Schwall, Matt	
Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Murray, Patrick	Kochonies, Karen	Ezickson, Doron							
NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Joseph , Kelli	Fuller , Peter	Cona , Lisa							
New York Transco	Other Suppliers	Nachmias, Stuart	Hitti , Nabil	Caso , Rob	Carrigan , Kathleen	Dumais , Paul	McKinney , Jeff				
NextEra Energy	Other Suppliers	Applebaum, David	Gardner , Michelle	Gibelli , Stephen						✓ Schwall, Matt	
Ontario Power Generation, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Lacivita, Ken	Gell, Richard	Barr, David	Sheinfield , Joel						
PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Other Suppliers	✓Fromer, Howard	DePillo , Raymond	Cimino , David	Murawski , James					✓ Fromer, Howard	
Riverbay Corporation	Other Suppliers	Merola , Peter	Ellison , Noel	Ahrens, David	Villegas , Cristina						
SESCO Enterprises, LLC	Other Suppliers	Schubiger, Michael	Thoresen, James								
Shell Energy North America, LLC	Other Suppliers	✓Picardi, Matt									
Talen Energy	Other Suppliers	Hohenshilt , Jennifer	Labela , Julie	Raggio , Debra						✓ Schwall, Matt	
TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.	Other Suppliers	Cahill , Paul	Schuler , Richard	Murphy , Tonya						✓ Schwall, Matt	

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Viridity Energy, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Freifeld , Allen									
Vitol Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Wadsworth , Joe	Viola , Bob	Kahn , Casey							
XO Energy NY, LP	Other Suppliers	Drangula , Carey	Thompson , Matthew	Hughes , Adam							
Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Transmission Owners	✓Borchert , John	✓Chan, Ting	May , Jeff	Dittmann, David						
Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Transmission Owners	✓Quin , Jane	Nachmias, Stuart	Butler , Scott	✓Hargett , Chris	Butterklee, Neil					
National Grid	Transmission Owners	✓Janzen , Margaret	Lodemore , David	Carron , Benjamin							
New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Transmission Owners	✓Caletka, Patricia	Kinney, Ray	✓Brophy , Richard							
Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.	Transmission Owners										
Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.	Transmission Owners	✓Caletka, Patricia	Kinney, Ray	✓Brophy , Richard							
Alcoa, Inc.	Large Consumer	Mager, Michael	Loughney, Robert	Trinsey , Amanda	✓Lang, Kevin						
IBM Corporation	Large Consumer	Mager, Michael	Loughney, Robert	Trinsey , Amanda	✓Lang, Kevin						
Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.	Large Consumer	Brew , James	Mackaronis , Chris								
Occidental Chemical Corp.	Large Consumer	Mager, Michael	Loughney, Robert	Trinsey , Amanda	✓Lang, Kevin						
Wegmans Food Markets	Large Consumer	Mager, Michael	Loughney, Robert	Trinsey , Amanda	✓Lang, Kevin						
Metropolitan Transportation Authority	Large Consumer Government Agency	Keller , David	Chou , Frances								
American Sugar Refining, Inc	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	✓Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓Lang, Kevin	Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Association for Energy Affordability	Small Consumer	Strauss , Valerie	Hepinstall, David	Farmer , Miles							
Beth Israel Health Care System	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	✓Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓Lang, Kevin	Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Fordham University	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	✓Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓Lang, Kevin	Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	✓Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓Lang, Kevin	Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Mount Sinai Medical Center	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	✓Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓Lang, Kevin	Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
New York University	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	✓Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓Lang, Kevin	Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Government Statewide Consumer Advocate	Hogan , Erin	✓Montalvo , Marc	✓Kordonis , Dimitrios	Zimmerman , Michael						
City of New York	Government Small Consumer and Retail Aggregate	✓Lang, Kevin	Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda							
NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Government Small Consumer and Retail Aggregate	✓Hall , Christopher	Coup, David	Mas , Carl	Wilcox , James	Matteson , Schuyler					
Long Island Power Authority	State Power Authorities	✓Clarke, Dave	✓Wilczek , Mariann								
New York Power Authority	State Power Authorities	✓Antinori , Andrew	✓Lundin , Tim	✓Mahoney , Daniel							
Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Municipalities and Coops	Bonacci , Erin	✓Wentlent, Chris	Cordeiro, Mark							
Freepport Electric	Municipalities and Coops	Livingston , Al	Kimlingen, Ted	✓Rudebusch, Tom	Fiore , Chris						
Jamestown Board of Public Utilities	Municipalities and Coops	Sellstrom , Kris	Leathers, David	Allen , Cory	✓Rudebusch, Tom						
Lake Placid Village	Municipalities and Coops	Daby , Kimball	✓Wentlent, Chris	Cordeiro, Mark							
Municipal Commission of Boonville	Municipalities and Coops	Varner , Doug	✓Wentlent, Chris	Cordeiro, Mark							
Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Municipalities and Coops	Treacy, William	✓Wentlent, Chris	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Arcade	Municipalities and Coops	Kilburn, Larry	✓Wentlent, Chris	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Fairport	Municipalities and Coops	Hegarty , Matt	✓Wentlent, Chris	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Rockville Centre	Municipalities and Coops	Andreas , Philip	Valenzano , Michael	✓Rudebusch, Tom							
Village of Solvay	Municipalities and Coops	Hawksby , Joe	✓Wentlent, Chris	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Westfield	Municipalities and Coops	Thompson , Andrew	✓Wentlent, Chris	Cordeiro, Mark							
American Wind Energy Association	Environmental	Reynolds , Anne	Reeder , Mark	Beck , Betsy	Goggin , Michael	Grace , Gene					
Environmental Advocates	Environmental	Bambrick , Conor	Farmer , Miles	Morris, Jackson							
Environmental Defense Fund	Environmental	Christian , Rory	Stein , Elizabeth								
Natural Resources Defense Council	Environmental	Farmer , Miles	Morris, Jackson	De Costanzo , Donna							
PACE Energy & Climate Center	Environmental	Musgrove , Sheryl	Taylor , Geordi	Farmer , Miles							
Riverkeeper	Environmental	Gallay , Paul	Jones , Abigail	Doran , Erin							
AEP On-Site Partners, LLC	Non Voting	Jansen , Joel	Kakodkar , Guatam								
AES ES Holdings LLC	Non Voting	Hillman , Sharon	Kumaraswamy , Kiran								
Acadia Center	Non Voting	Howland , Jamie	Howe , Cullen								
Acadia Energy Corporation	Non Voting	Rappaport , Jason	Bay , John								
Alliance for Clean Energy New York	Non Voting	Reynolds , Anne	Dufresne , Zach	Reeder , Mark							
Anbaric Northeast Transmission Development Co.	Non Voting	Sanderson , Barry	Kosel , Howard								
Appian Way Energy Partners East, LLC	Non Voting	Levy , Tal	Klein , Abram	Shen , Dong	Westlund , John	Laich , Marcus					
Ardor Energy LLC	Non Voting	Breen , Erika									
Boston Energy Marketing & Trading	Non Voting	Kramek , Mike									
Bruce Power	Non Voting	Jain , Anshul	Meyer , Sandra								
Caithness Energy LLC	Non Voting	Keevill , Gary	Alvarez , Asavari	Garber, Mitchell							
Calpine Energy Solutions	Non Voting	Sun , Jungsuk	Nakhonthap , Jade	✓Sunga , Leonard							
Canandaigua Power Partners, LLC	Non Voting	Keene , John	Gaddes , Caleb								
Cubit Power One Inc.	Non Voting	Powell , Alan	Powell , Leighton	Singer, Leonard							
Customized Energy Solutions	Non Voting	✓Mancini, Rick	Fernands, Stephen	Rexrode, Caryn	✓Ackerman, Alan						
Cypress Creek Renewables	Non Voting	Kohlstedt , Kevin	Kemp , Melissa	Salehian , Afshin							

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Earth Networks	Non Voting	Crawford , Jaden									
Energya VM	Non Voting	Garcia , Francisco	Maeso , Manual	Lopez , Ana	Corvillo , Cristina						
Fluent Energy	Non Voting	Acampora , Peter	Doll , Ed								
GI Energy	Non Voting	Falcier , Peter	Robinson , James								
Hudson River Energy Group	Non Voting	Radigan, Frank	Canfield, Richard								
Hydro-Quebec TransEnergie	Non Voting	Prevost , Michel									
ITC Mid-Atlantic Development LLC	Non Voting	Wrenbeck , Tom	Benedict , Nathan								
Iberdrola Renewables Inc	Non Voting	Allen, Thresa									
Institute for Policy Integrity at NYU School of Law	Non Voting	Unel , Burcin	Noll , Bethany								
Key Capture Energy	Non Voting	Fitzgerald , Dan	Bishop , Jeff								
MAG Energy Solutions, Inc.	Non Voting	Pelletier , Simon	Vezina, Alexandre								
NRG Curtailment Solutions, Inc.	Non Voting	Popova , Julia	Ainspan , Malcolm	Pieniazek, Marie							
NY-BEST Consortium	Non Voting	Acker , William	Sheehan , Denise								
NYS Department of Public Service	Non Voting	✓Paynter , Thomas	✓Evans , Adam								
National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation	Non Voting	Novak , Michael	Eck , Robert								
New Athens Generating Co. LLC	Non Voting	Tripp , Hank									
Northeast Clean Heat & Power Initiative	Non Voting	Venkataraman , Sree	Brown, Ruben	Cinadr , Matt	Dwyer , Herb						
Northline Utilities LLC	Non Voting	McKinney , Jeff	Danskin , Susan								
NuEnergen	Non Voting	Hamilton , Sandy	Korczykowski , Ryan								
Power Supply Services LLC	Non Voting	Phillips , Gabriel	✓Abend , Erik								
RBC Energy Services, LP	Non Voting	Burnham , Steve	Fraiture , Christian	Doolittle , Robin							
RENEW Northeast	Non Voting	Pullaro , Francis	Krich , Abigail								
RES Americas, Inc.	Non Voting	Fernandes , John	Boyd , Dan								
Red Wolf Energy Trading, LLC	Non Voting	Christian , Adam									
Richard P. Felak	Non Voting	Felak, Rich									
STEM, Inc.	Non Voting	Ko , Ted									
Saracen Energy East LP	Non Voting	Peebles , Andy									
Siemens Energy, Inc.	Non Voting	Feltes , James									
Stephentown Spindle, LLC	Non Voting	Hebert , Chris									
Taylor Biomass Energy, LLC	Non Voting	Taylor , Jim	Page , Allan								
Tesla Motors, Inc.	Non Voting	Burson , Kate	Van Cleve , Sarah	Watson , Betty							
TransAlta Energy Marketing (U.S.) Inc.	Non Voting	Nivolianitis , Ted									
Transmission Developers Inc.	Non Voting	Jessome , Donald	Helmer , William	✓Dave , Suresh							
Transource New York, LLC	Non Voting	Burkholder , Joshua									
William P. Short	Non Voting	Short, William	Schaefer, Marc		Savage, Paul	Verna, Jim					

New York Independent System Operator
Business Issues Committee - February 14, 2018

Motion: Motion #1

Result: Motion Passed

Sector with base percent	%	Active	Quorum	Adj. Percent	For	Against	Abstain	% For	% Against
Generation Owners	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	2.00	2.00	8.00	10.75	10.75
Other Suppliers	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	2.00	2.00	17.00	10.75	10.75
Transmission Owners	20.00	✓	✓	20.00	4.00	0.00	0.00	20.00	0.00
End Use Consumer			✓						
Large Consumer	9.00	✓		9.00	4.00	0.00	0.00	10.33	0.00
Large Cons. Gov. Agency	2.00	✓		2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Small Consumer	4.50	✓	✓	4.50	6.00	0.00	0.00	5.17	0.00
Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	2.70	✓		2.70	1.00	0.00	0.00	2.70	0.00
Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	1.80	✓		1.80	2.00	0.00	0.00	1.80	0.00
Public Power			✓						
State Power Authorities	8.00	✓		9.07	1.00	1.00	0.00	4.53	4.53
Munis & Co-ops	7.00	✓		7.93	8.00	0.00	3.00	7.93	0.00
Environmental	2.00	✓		0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
			5	100.00	30.00	5.00	28.00	73.96	26.03
				100.00	Normalize to 100% :			73.97	26.03

New York Independent System Operator

Business Issues Committee - February 14, 2018

Motion: Motion #1

Result: Motion Passed

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Generation Owners	Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Astoria Energy LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Calpine	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	CPV Valley LLC	Litchfield, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	East Coast Power, LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Saia, Doreen	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Innovative Energy Systems		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Noble Environmental Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	EDP Renewables North America LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Cricket Valley Energy Center	Wallenstein, Arnold	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Invenergy Energy Management LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	National Grid Generation LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Howard Wind LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Bayonne Energy Center, LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Helix Ravenswood LLC	D'Andrea, James	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Empire Generating Co, LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BJ Energy LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Citigroup Energy Inc.	Trayers, Barry	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Con Edison Solutions Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Constellation New Energy		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC	Rotger, Jose	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DC Energy	Bleiweis, Bruce	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DTE Energy	German, Robert	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Spectrum		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnerNoc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Galt Power	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	HQ Energy Services US	Leuthauser, Scott	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Joseph, Kelli	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Ontario Power Generation, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Exelon Generating Co. LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Fromer, Howard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	SESCO Enterprises, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Shell Energy North America, LLC	Picardi, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BP Energy Company	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EDF Trading North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NextEra Energy	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Innoventive Power		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Vitol Inc.	Wadsworth, Joe	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Viridity Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Riverbay Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BlueRock Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Other Suppliers	Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC	Galarneau, Kenneth	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Technology Savings		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Mercuria Energy America, Inc.	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	New York Transco		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Talen Energy	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	CPower	Dotson-Westphalen, Peter	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	XO Energy NY, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Dyegy Marketing and Trade	Roby, Rick	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Brookfield Energy Marketing L.P.	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Eastern Generation	Baker, Liam	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BioUrja Power, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Drift Marketplace, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Caletka, Patricia	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Borchert, John	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Quin, Jane	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	National Grid	Janzen, Margaret	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Alcoa, Inc.	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	IBM Corporation	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Occidental Chemical Corp.	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Wegmans Food Markets	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Cons. Gov. Agency	Metropolitan Transportation Authority		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	American Sugar Refining, Inc	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Beth Israel Health Care System	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Fordham University	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Mount Sinai Medical Center	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	New York University	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Association for Energy Affordability		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Montalvo, Marc	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Hall, Christopher	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	City of New York	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	Long Island Power Authority	Clarke, Dave	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	New York Power Authority	Antinori, Andrew	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Freeport Electric	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Jamestown Board of Public Utilities	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Lake Placid Village	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Municipal Commission of Boonville	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Westfield	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Solvay	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Arcade	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Fairport	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Rockville Centre	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Wind Energy Association		N	N	0.00	0.00

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Advocates		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Natural Resources Defense Council		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	PACE Energy & Climate Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Riverkeeper		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Defense Fund		N	N	0.00	0.00

New York Independent System Operator
Business Issues Committee - February 14, 2018

Motion: Motion #2

Result: Motion Failed

Sector with base percent	%	Active	Quorum	Adj. Percent	For	Against	Abstain	% For	% Against	
Generation Owners	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	1.00	11.00	1.00	1.79	19.71	
Other Suppliers	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	0.00	14.00	7.00	0.00	21.50	
Transmission Owners	20.00	✓	✓	20.00	3.00	0.00	1.00	20.00	0.00	
End Use Consumer			✓							
Large Consumer	9.00	✓		9.00	4.00	0.00	0.00	10.33	0.00	
Large Cons. Gov. Agency	2.00	✓		2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Small Consumer	4.50	✓	✓	4.50	6.00	0.00	0.00	5.17	0.00	
Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	2.70	✓		2.70	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	
Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	1.80	✓		1.80	2.00	0.00	0.00	4.50	0.00	
Public Power			✓							
State Power Authorities	8.00	✓		9.07	1.00	1.00	0.00	4.53	4.53	
Munis & Co-ops	7.00	✓		7.93	8.00	0.00	3.00	7.93	0.00	
Environmental	2.00	✓		0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
				5	100.00	25.00	26.00	13.00	54.25	45.74
					100.00	Normalize to 100% :		54.26	45.74	

New York Independent System Operator

Business Issues Committee - February 14, 2018

Motion: Motion #2

Result: Motion Failed

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Generation Owners	Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Astoria Energy LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Calpine	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	CPV Valley LLC	Litchfield, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	East Coast Power, LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Saia, Doreen	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Innovative Energy Systems		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Noble Environmental Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	EDP Renewables North America LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Cricket Valley Energy Center	Wallenstein, Arnold	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Invenergy Energy Management LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	National Grid Generation LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Howard Wind LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Bayonne Energy Center, LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Helix Ravenswood LLC	D'Andrea, James	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Empire Generating Co, LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BJ Energy LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Citigroup Energy Inc.	Trayers, Barry	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Con Edison Solutions Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Constellation New Energy		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC	Rotger, Jose	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	DC Energy	Bleiweis, Bruce	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DTE Energy	German, Robert	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Spectrum		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnerNoc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Galt Power	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	HQ Energy Services US	Leuthauser, Scott	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Joseph, Kelli	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Ontario Power Generation, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Exelon Generating Co. LLC	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Fromer, Howard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	SESCO Enterprises, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Shell Energy North America, LLC	Picardi, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	BP Energy Company	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	EDF Trading North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NextEra Energy	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Innoventive Power		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Vitol Inc.	Wadsworth, Joe	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Viridity Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Riverbay Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BlueRock Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Other Suppliers	Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC	Galarneau, Kenneth	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Technology Savings		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Mercuria Energy America, Inc.	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	New York Transco		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Talen Energy	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	CPower	Dotson-Westphalen, Peter	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	XO Energy NY, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Dyegy Marketing and Trade	Roby, Rick	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Brookfield Energy Marketing L.P.	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Eastern Generation	Baker, Liam	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	BioUrja Power, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Drift Marketplace, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Caletka, Patricia	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Borchert, John	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Quin, Jane	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	National Grid	Janzen, Margaret	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Alcoa, Inc.	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	IBM Corporation	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Occidental Chemical Corp.	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Wegmans Food Markets	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Cons. Gov. Agency	Metropolitan Transportation Authority		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	American Sugar Refining, Inc	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Beth Israel Health Care System	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Fordham University	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Mount Sinai Medical Center	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	New York University	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Association for Energy Affordability		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Montalvo, Marc	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Hall, Christopher	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	City of New York	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	Long Island Power Authority	Clarke, Dave	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	New York Power Authority	Antinori, Andrew	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Freeport Electric	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Jamestown Board of Public Utilities	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Lake Placid Village	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Municipal Commission of Boonville	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Westfield	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Solvay	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Arcade	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Fairport	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Rockville Centre	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Wind Energy Association		N	N	0.00	0.00

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Advocates		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Natural Resources Defense Council		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	PACE Energy & Climate Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Riverkeeper		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Defense Fund		N	N	0.00	0.00