Avoiding Over-Subscription and Unnecessary Shortfall

How do we help insure that a realistic set of transmission rights is sold that:

- a) Can be reasonably expected to be physically supported thereby avoiding unnecessary shortfall
- b) Avoids unnecessary surplus
- c) Assigns costs fairly thereby sending correct price signals
- d) Treats grandfathered rights the same as other rights

Illustrative Example:



(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6) Congestion	(7)	(8)	(9) Capability
то	Inter- face	Interface's Physical Capability (MW)	Interface's Expected Availability (%)	Average Expected Capability (MW)	Price Across the Interface (\$/MWh)	Expected Annual Shortfall (\$millions)	Grand- fathered Capability (MW)	Surplus (Shortfall) Available for TCC Auction (MW)
Α	W-X	2,000	95%	1,900	\$ 9	\$ 7.9	2,000	(100)
В	X-Y	2,000	95%	1,900	\$10	\$ 8.8	1,500	400
С	Y-Z	2,000	95%	1,900	\$11	\$ 9.6	1,000	900
Total Shortfall						\$ 26.3		

Assumptions and Calculations

Col. 1 = Transmission Owner which has/will receive revenue from sale of transmission rights on the Interface in Col. 2, and which is responsible for outages/derates on that interface.

Col. 3 = Full capability of interface ignoring loss of availability caused by outages and derates.

Col. 4 = Average availability of interface after taking expected outages and derates into account based upon historical performance (expected to reoccur) and specific planned outages known in advance -- it does not include unanticipated non-reoccurring "one-time" outages.

- Col. 5 = (Col. 3) x (Col. 4).
- Col. 6 = (LMP on Downstream Side of Interface) (LMP on Upstream Side of Interface).
- Col. 7 = [(Col. 3) (Col. 5)] x (Col. 6) x 8,760 hours / (1,000,000).
- Col. 8 are different levels of Grandfathered Transmission Rights assumed.
- Col. 9 = (Col. 5) (Col. 8) -- A positive value indicates capability available to sell in the TCC Auction; a negative value indicates capability that has been "oversold".

Comments on Options to Reduce Shortfall

(Listed on Con Ed 5/1/2003 slide presentation, pages 10 and 11)

<u>Option 1</u>: Withhold TCCs from the 6 Month Auction – Release them as they are deemed available for the monthly reconfiguration auctions

- Needs to be conducted on an interface by interface basis can not use surpluses generated from one interface (taking revenue from one set of TOs) to offset shortfalls generated by another interface (giving revenue to another set of TOs)
- Needs to apply to grandfathered rights as well (i.e., grandfathered rights need to be derated if physical capability is not available)
- Withheld amounts need to be rational, reasonable and defendable
- Problem will still exist in that the one-month ahead forecast will have inaccuracies
- Makes more sense once shortfall costs are reallocated to the TO responsible (e.g., using SCRP or LECG "Make Whole Approach" method)

Option 2: Eliminate Full Funding

- Reduces TCC revenue for TOs, but will also reduce risk to TOs thereby potentially resulting in a net decrease to TSC charges
- Not really a way to reduce shortfall but buyers of transmission rights will be getting closer to what they actually paid for (grandfathered rights will be treated the same)
- Over- or under-subscription of interfaces will be reflected in TCC market prices
- May provide some incentive for TOs to reduce shortfall since a TCC with a higher expected availability will theoretically be worth more in the TCC Auction (this may be strengthened by development of an additional shortfall reduction incentive)
- Needs to be done on an interface-by-interface basis so that shortfall generated by an interface will be charged to purchases of transmission rights across that interface

Option 3: Charge Shortfalls to Schedule 1 Uplift

- Certainly not a way to reduce shortfall!
- Doesn't address over-subscription of interfaces
- This is simply a cost-shift from TOs and purchasers of transmission rights to LSEs on inequitable inefficient basis without regard to those that benefit
- May even increase shortfall eliminates incentive for TOs to reduce shortfall; probably provides a perverse incentive for TOs to increase shortfall